

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

-----X  
STEVEN GOLDSTEIN, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

*-against-*

KATHY HOCHUL, et al.,

Defendants.

**SUPPLEMENTAL  
DECLARATION OF  
STEVEN GOLDSTEIN**

Index No: 22-CV-8300 (VLS)

-----X  
I, Steven Goldstein, declare as follows in response to the factual questions raised in this Court's Order dated October 27, 2022 and during the October 28 show cause hearing. This Court's questions are presented in bold, and my responses follow:

1. **When did Plaintiff Goldstein obtain his license to possess a firearm on the premises of Congregation Bnei Matisyahu's synagogue?**

Response: I obtained my firearm license approximately 10 years ago.

2. **Prior to obtaining his firearm license, did Plaintiff Goldstein participate in religious activities at Bnei Matisyahu or attend shul at another location, and if yes, how frequently?**

Response: Yes. Before obtaining my firearm license, I participated in religious activities four times a week at Bnei Matisyahu and six times a week elsewhere.

3. **How frequently did Plaintiff Goldstein attend Congregation Bnei Matisyahu ("Bnei Matisyahu") prior to September 1, 2022?**

Response: Bnei Matisyahu's synagogue is only open on the Jewish Sabbath, it only holds services four to five times per week on average. I attended the synagogue of Bnei Matisyahu for every one of those services prior to September 1, 2022.

4. **After Plaintiff Goldstein obtained his firearm license, did he carry a firearm each time he attended Bnei Matisyahu prior to September 1, 2022?**

Response: Yes, after obtaining my license, I carried a firearm each time I attended prior to September 1, 2022.

5. **If not, how many times did he not carry his firearm during this time period?**

Response: Not applicable. See Response to Question 4, above.

6. **How frequently did Plaintiff Goldstein attend Bnei Matisyahu after September 1, 2022?**

Response: After September 1, 2022, I attended once every other week.

7. **Did he ever carry a firearm when he attended Bnei Matisyahu after September 1, 2022?**

Response: I assert the Fifth Amendment in response to this question.

8. **After obtaining his firearm license but before September 1, 2022, did Plaintiff Goldstein attend any shuls other than Bnei Matisyahu?**

Response: Yes.

9. **If so, approximately how many times did he attend other shuls, and did he carry a firearm each time?**

Response: I attended some other shuls here and there, but primarily I used to attend Congregation Bnei Matisyahu. On those occasions that I attended other shuls, I did not carry a firearm, because my firearms license was (and is) limited to the premises of Bnei Matisyahu.

10. **Has Plaintiff Goldstein attended Bnei Matisyahu since it opened approximately 11 years ago?**

Response: Yes. I have attended Bnei Matisyahu since the first day it opened.

11. **If not, when did he begin attending?**

Response: Not applicable. See Response to Question 10, above.

12. **How many adults are members of Bnei Matisyahu?**

Response: Approximately thirty to forty.

13. **Does Bnei Matisyahu receive contributions or donations from individuals or entities that are not members of the Congregation?**

Response: To my knowledge, Bnei Matisyahu does not receive contributions or donations from individuals or entities that are not members of the Congregation.

14. **Since Plaintiff Goldstein obtained a license to carry a firearm, has he gone to any other places of worship other than Bnei Matisyahu?**

Response: Yes, during that time period, I have gone to other places of worship.

15. **If so, did he carry a firearm?**

Response: Not in New York, since my New York license only allows me to carry a firearm on the premises of Bnei Matisyahu. When I am in Florida, however, my carry license is unrestricted, so I carry firearm to all shuls I attend there.

16. **Since Plaintiff Goldstein obtained a license to carry a firearm does he carry a gun whenever he leaves his home?**

Response: No.

17. **If not, why not?**

Response: In New York, I have a premises firearm license only, and therefore I am only allowed to carry on the subject premises.

18. **Prior to September 1, 2022, did any other members of Bnei Matisyahu carry firearms in Bnei Matisyahu?**

Response: No. I was the only one who carried a firearm at Bnei Matisyahu.

**Questions Posed by the Court at the Show Cause Hearing<sup>1</sup>**

19. **Has there been any police presence at your shul for security?**

Response: No there is no police presence. In the past, there was a unit that stopped by once a day for about sixty seconds on the High Holidays.

20. **Has Bnei Matisyahu ever hired outside security?**

---

<sup>1</sup> This declaration was prepared without the benefit of the transcript of the show cause hearing. The questions included herein are based off plaintiffs' counsels' handwritten notes.

Response: No. Bnei Matisyahu does not have the funds to hire outside security.

**21. Does Plaintiff Goldstein have firearms licenses in any other state jurisdictions? How many and which ones?**

Response: I have two premise permits in New York – one for Bnei Matisyahu and one for my home. I also have a carry license in Florida.

**22. How long has Plaintiff Goldstein had a Florida carry license for?**

Response: I have had the Florida license for more than five years.

**23. In Florida, does Plaintiff Goldstein carry his firearm at shul every time he goes?**

Response: Yes.

**24. In Florida, does Plaintiff Goldstein limit his carriage of a firearm to when he is at shul, or does he carry it in other locations, as well?**

Response: When in Florida, I carry my firearm in all locations where I am legally allowed to do so.

**25. Please produce legible, color photo copies of all of Plaintiff Goldstein's firearms licenses.**

Response: True and accurate color copies of my licenses are annexed hereto as Exhibit 1.

**26. Has Bnei Congregation ever received money from any government entities?**

Response: Bnei Matisyahu received approximately \$6,000 in PPP funding. Other than that, it has never received any government money to my knowledge.

**27. Does Plaintiff Goldstein transport his firearm outside of Bnei Matisyahu?**

Response: No. There is a safe in the shul, and the firearm stays in the safe in the shul.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of New York that the foregoing is true and correct. A copy of my signature, sent electronically or by facsimile transmission, may be treated as the original for the purpose of serving and filing this declaration, and the original will be provided if required.

Executed this 1<sup>st</sup> day of November, 2022

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'S. Goldstein', written over a horizontal line.

November

Steven Goldstein